# Topics in Fusion and Plasma Studies 2 (459.667, 3 Credits)

**Prof. Dr. Yong-Su Na** (32-206, Tel. 880-7204)

## Contents

Week 1-2. The MHD Model, General Properties of Ideal MHD Week 3. Equilibrium: General Considerations Week 4. Equilibrium: One-, Two-Dimensional Configurations Week 5. Equilibrium: Two-Dimensional Configurations Week 6-7. Numerical Solution of the GS Equation Week 9-10. Stability: General Considerations Week 11-12. Stability: One-Dimensional Configurations Week 13-14. Stability: Multidimensional Configurations Week 15. Project Presentation and Summary

# Contents

Week 1-2. The MHD Model, General Properties of Ideal MHD Week 3. Equilibrium: General Considerations Week 4. Equilibrium: One-, Two-Dimensional Configurations Week 5. Equilibrium: Two-Dimensional Configurations Week 6-7. Numerical Solution of the GS Equation Week 9-10. Stability: General Considerations Week 11-12. Stability: One-Dimensional Configurations Week 13-14. Stability: Multidimensional Configurations Week 15. Project Presentation and Summary

# Textbook

- J. Freidberg,

"Ideal Magnetohydrodynamics (Modern Perspectives in Energy)", Springer, 1st edition (1987)

T. Takeda and S. Tokuda,
 "Computation of MHD Equilibrium of Tokamak Plasma",
 Journal of Computational Physics,
 Vol. 93, p1~107 (1991)

# The Origin of the Star Energy







Nobel prize in physics 1967 "for his contribution to the theory of nuclear reactions, especially his discoveries concerning the energy production in stars"

Hans Albrecht Bethe (1906. 7. 2 – 2005. 3. 6)

## To build a sun on earth



# **Magnetic confinement**

#### Imitation of the Sun on Earth





Equilibrium in the sun

Plasma on earth much, much smaller & tiny mass!

# Tokamak

JET (Joint European Torus): R<sub>0</sub>=3m, a=0.9m, 1983-today



# Tokamak

JET (Joint European Torus): R<sub>0</sub>=3m, a=0.9m, 1983-today



#### How to describe fusion plasmas?

## What is Ideal MHD?

- Ideal MHD
- Ideal:

Perfect conductor with zero resistivity

- MHD:

Magnetohydrodynamic (magnetic fluid dynamic)

- Single-fluid model:

electrically charged current-carrying fluid.





### **Derivation of the Ideal MHD Model**

#### Starting Equations

 $\frac{\partial f_{\alpha}}{\partial t} + \vec{u} \cdot \nabla f_{\alpha} + \frac{q_{\alpha}}{m_{\alpha}} (\vec{E} + \vec{u} \times \vec{B}) \cdot \nabla_{u} f_{\alpha} = \left(\frac{\partial f_{\alpha}}{\partial t}\right)_{c}$ 



Ludwig Boltzmann (1844-1906)



James Clark Maxwell (1831-1879)









### **Derivation of the Ideal MHD Model**

#### Assumptions

- First asymptotic assumption:  $\varepsilon_0 \rightarrow 0$ (Full  $\rightarrow$  low-frequency Maxwell's equations)

$$\nabla \times \vec{B} = \mu_0 e \left( n_i \vec{v}_i - n_e \vec{v}_e \right) + \frac{1}{c^2} \frac{\partial \vec{E}}{\partial t} \approx \mu_0 \vec{J}$$

 $n_i - n_e = \frac{\mathcal{E}_0}{e} \nabla \cdot \vec{E} \approx 0$  quasineutrality  $\rightarrow$  displacement current, net charge neglected

- Second asymptotic assumption:  $m_e \rightarrow 0$ (electron inertia neglected: electrons have an infinitely fast response time because of their small mass)

$$n_e m_e \left(\frac{d\vec{v}_e}{dt}\right) = -e n_e (\vec{E} + \vec{v}_e \times \vec{B}) - \nabla \cdot \vec{P}_e + \vec{R}_e \approx 0$$

- Third assumption: collision dominated plasma

ions  $\omega \tau_{ii} \sim V_{T_i} \tau_{ii} / a \ll 1$ 

electrons  $\omega \tau_{ee} \sim (m_e / m_i)^{1/2} V_{T_i} \tau_{ii} / a << 1$ 

### **Derivation of the Ideal MHD Model**

#### Ideal MHD model

Mass continuity equation

$$\rho \frac{d\vec{v}}{dt} = \vec{J} \times \vec{B} - \nabla p$$

 $\frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \rho \vec{v} = 0$ 

Single-fluid equation of motion

$$\frac{d}{dt}\left(\frac{p}{\rho^{\gamma}}\right) = 0$$

Energy equation (equation of state): adiabatic evolution

 $\vec{E} + \vec{v} \times \vec{B} = 0$ 

Ohm's law: perfect conductor  $\rightarrow$  "ideal" MHD

 $\nabla \times \vec{E} = -\frac{\partial \vec{B}}{\partial t}$  $\nabla \times \vec{B} = \mu_0 \vec{J}$  $\nabla \cdot \vec{B} = 0$ 

Maxwell equations



### **General Properties of Ideal MHD**

#### Conservation of Flux: "Frozen" Field Line Picture

 A consequence of the perfect conductivity Ohm's law, is that the magnetic flux passing through any arbitrary open surface area moving with the plasma is constant.



time rate of change of the flux passing through any moving surface, S

- Magnetic lines move with the plasma; they are "frozen" into the fluid.

Ideal MHD:  $\eta = 0$ 





Resistive MHD:  $\eta \neq 0$ 

### **General Properties of Ideal MHD**

#### Conservation of Flux: "Frozen" Field Line Picture

 A consequence of the perfect conductivity Ohm's law, is that the magnetic flux passing through any arbitrary open surface area moving with the plasma is constant.



time rate of change of the flux passing through any moving surface, S

- Magnetic lines move with the plasma; they are "frozen" into the fluid.

Ideal MHD:  $\eta = 0$ 



Resistive MHD:  $\eta \neq 0$ 

## Limitations

- sighting the derivation of MHD Eliminated in the derivation of MHD physics
  - wave propagation
- Important processes in fusion mas Not adequately described by
- Radiation
- RF heating
- Resonant
  - alous transport
- Resistive instabilities
- alpha-particle behaviour



How does a given magnetic geometry provide forces to hold a plasma in equilibrium?

Why are certain magnetic geometries much more stable against macroscopic disturbances than others?

Why do fusion configurations have such technologically undesirable shapes as a torus, a helix, or a baseball seam?







#### Plasma Eqauilibrium and Stability

### **Equilibrium and Stability**





### Equilibrium

#### Basic Equations

MHD equilibrium equations:
 time-independent with v = 0 (static)

$$\vec{J} \times \vec{B} = \nabla p$$
$$\nabla \times \vec{B} = \mu_0 \vec{J}$$
$$\nabla \cdot \vec{B} = 0$$

cf) stationary equilibrium with nonzero flows:  $\mathbf{v} << V_{\tau_i}$  (ideal MHD)



$$\frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \rho \vec{v} = 0$$
$$\rho \frac{d\vec{v}}{dt} = \vec{J} \times \vec{B} - \nabla p$$
$$\frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{p}{\rho^{\gamma}}\right) = 0$$
$$\vec{E} + \vec{v} \times \vec{B} = 0$$
$$\nabla \times \vec{E} = -\frac{\partial \vec{B}}{\partial t}$$
$$\nabla \times \vec{B} = \mu_0 \vec{J}$$
$$\nabla \cdot \vec{B} = 0$$

## Equilibrium

#### Toroidicity

- Why are most fusion configurations toroidal?
- Answer: Avoid parallel end losses



- Dominant loss mechanism is heat loss via thermal conduction.
- Heat loss is more severe along **B** than  $\perp$  to **B** because charged particles move freely along magnetic field lines. The magnetic field confines particles in the  $\perp$  direction.

$$\frac{\kappa_{||e|}}{\kappa_{\perp i}} = 1.12 \left(\frac{m_i}{m_e}\right)^{1/2} (\omega_{ci}\tau_{ii})^2 \approx 6.2 \times 10^{10} \left(\frac{B^2 T_i^3}{n^2}\right) \quad \longleftarrow \quad \begin{array}{l} Z = 1, \quad m_i = 2m_{proton} \\ T_e = T_i \\ \ln \Lambda = 15 \end{array}$$





$$\kappa_{|k} / \kappa_{\perp i} = 3.1 \times 10^{12}$$
  
 $T_i = 2 \text{keV}, \quad B = 5 \text{T}, \quad n = 2 \times 10^{20} \text{ m}^{-3}$ 



#### Basic Forces Acting on Tokamak Plasmas



- Basic Forces Acting on Tokamak Plasmas
  - Hoop force





- 1/R force



#### Basic Forces Acting on Tokamak Plasmas

- External coils required to provide the force balance



#### Basic Forces Acting on Tokamak Plasmas

- External coils required to provide the force balance



#### How to describe the equilibrium of plasmas?

#### The Grad-Shafranov Equation

- obtained from the reduction of the ideal MHD equations
- exact (no expansion)
- Toroidal axisymmetric  $\partial/\partial \phi = 0$
- 2 dimensional
- nonlinear
- partial differential equation
- elliptic characteristics
- Grad and Rubin (1958), Shafranov (1960)

 $\vec{J} \times \vec{B} = \nabla p$  $\nabla \times \vec{B} = \mu_0 \vec{J}$  $\nabla \cdot \vec{B} = 0$ 



#### The Grad-Shafranov Equation

$$\Delta^* \psi = -\mu_0 R^2 \frac{dp}{d\psi} - F \frac{dF}{d\psi}$$

$$\Delta^* \psi \equiv R^2 \nabla \cdot \left(\frac{\nabla \psi}{R^2}\right) = R \frac{\partial}{\partial R} \left(\frac{1}{R} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial R}\right) + \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial Z^2} \quad \text{ell}$$

elliptic operator

$$\begin{split} p &= p(\psi), \quad F = F(\psi) \\ \vec{B} &= \frac{1}{R} \nabla \psi \times \vec{e}_{\phi} + \frac{F}{R} \vec{e}_{\phi} \\ \mu_0 \vec{J} &= \frac{1}{R} \frac{dF}{d\psi} \nabla \psi \times \vec{e}_{\phi} - \frac{1}{R} \Delta^* \psi \vec{e}_{\phi} \\ \psi_p &= 2\pi \psi, \quad I_p = 2\pi F \end{split}$$

28

Plasma Parameters and Figures of Merit

Safety factor  

$$q(\psi) = \frac{2\pi}{\iota} = \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \left(\frac{rB_{\phi}}{RB_{\theta}}\right)_S d\theta = \frac{F(\psi)}{2\pi} \oint \frac{dl_p}{R^2 B_p}$$

- Kink safety factor

$$q_* = \frac{aB_0}{R_0\overline{B}_p}$$

Plasma beta
$$\beta_{t} = \frac{2\mu_{0}\langle p \rangle}{B_{0}^{2}}, \quad \beta_{p} = \frac{2\mu_{0}\langle p \rangle}{\overline{B}_{p}^{2}}$$
Magnetic shear
$$s(\psi) = 2\left(\frac{V}{V'}\right)\left(\frac{q'}{q}\right)$$
Magnetic well
$$W(\psi) = 2\left(\frac{V}{V'}\right)\left(\frac{\langle B^{2}/2 + \mu_{0}p \rangle}{\langle B^{2} \rangle}\right)$$

#### Numerical Calculation of Grad-Shafranov Equation





#### Definition of Stability



- assuming all quantities of interest linearised about their equilibrium values.

$$\begin{split} Q(\vec{r},t) &= Q_0(\vec{r}) + \widetilde{Q}_1(\vec{r},t) \\ \widetilde{Q}_1 / |Q_0| << 1 \qquad \widetilde{Q}_1(\vec{r},t) = Q_1(\vec{r}) \varepsilon^{-i\omega t} \\ \text{Im } \omega > 0: \text{ exponential instability} \\ \text{Im } \omega &\leq 0: \text{ exponential stability} \end{split}$$

small 1st order perturbation

#### Various Approaches for Stability Analyses

- 1. Initial value problem using the general linearised equations of motion
- 2. Normal-mode eigenvalue problem
- 3. Variational principle
- 4. Energy Principle

- Initial Value Formulation
- $\vec{J}_0 \times \vec{B}_0 = \nabla p_0$  $Q(\vec{r},t) = Q_0(\vec{r}) + \tilde{Q}_1(\vec{r},t) \quad \tilde{Q}_1/|Q_0| << 1$  $\mu_0 \vec{J}_0 = \nabla \times \vec{B}_0$ linearized  $\nabla \cdot \vec{B}_0 = 0$  $\vec{v}_{0} = 0$ 
  - $\widetilde{v}_1 = \frac{\partial \xi}{\partial t}$   $\xi$ : displacement of the plasma away from its equilibrium position

$$\rho \frac{\partial^2 \xi}{\partial t^2} = \vec{F}(\xi) \qquad \text{momentum equation}$$
  
$$\vec{F}(\xi) = \vec{J} \times \vec{B}_1 + \vec{J}_1 \times \vec{B} - \nabla \vec{p}_1 \quad \text{force operator}$$
  
$$= \frac{1}{\mu_0} (\nabla \times \vec{B}) \times \vec{Q} + \frac{1}{\mu_0} (\nabla \times \vec{Q}) \times \vec{B} + \nabla (\xi \cdot \nabla p + \gamma p \nabla \cdot \xi)$$
  
$$\xi(\vec{r}, 0) = 0, \quad \frac{\partial \xi(\vec{r}, 0)}{\partial t} = \vec{v}_1(\vec{r}, 0) \quad + \text{Boundary conditions}$$

Formulation of the generalized stability equations as an initial value problem

- Normal-Mode Formulation
- $\widetilde{Q}_1(\vec{r},t) = Q_1(\vec{r}) \exp(-i\omega t)$
- $$\begin{split} \rho_1 &= -\nabla \cdot (\rho \xi) & \text{conservation of mass} \\ p_1 &= -\xi \cdot \nabla p \gamma p \nabla \cdot \xi & \text{conservation of energy} \\ \vec{Q} &\equiv \vec{B}_1 = \nabla \times (\xi \times \vec{B}) & \text{Faraday's law} \end{split}$$

$$-\omega^{2}\rho\xi = \vec{F}(\xi) \quad \text{normal-mode formulation}$$
$$\vec{F}(\xi) = \frac{1}{\mu_{0}}(\nabla \times \vec{B}) \times \tilde{Q} + \frac{1}{\mu_{0}}(\nabla \times \tilde{Q}) \times \vec{B} + \nabla(\xi \cdot \nabla p + \gamma p \nabla \cdot \xi)$$

- An eigenvalue problem for the eigenvalue  $\omega^2$ 

#### Variational Principle

Classic eigenvalue problem

 $\frac{d}{dx}\left(f\frac{\partial y}{\partial x}\right) + (\lambda - g)y = 0 \qquad \lambda: \text{ eigenvalue}$ y(0) = y(1) = 0

$$\lambda = \frac{\int (fy'^2 + gy^2) dx}{\int y^2 dx}$$

Multiplied by y and integrated over the region  $0 \le x \le 1$ 

Why is this variational?

- Substitute all allowable trial function y(x) into the equation above.
- When resulting  $\lambda$  exhibits an extremum (maximum, minimum, saddle point) then  $\lambda$  and y are actual eigenvalue and eigenfunction.

$$\delta \lambda \approx -\frac{2\int \delta y[(fy_0')' + (\lambda_0 - g)y_0]dx}{\int y_0^2 dx}$$

#### • Variational Principle

 $-\omega^2 \rho \xi = \vec{F}(\xi)$  normal-mode formulation

$$\omega^{2} = \frac{\delta W(\xi^{*},\xi)}{K(\xi^{*},\xi)} \quad \text{dot product with } \xi^{*} \text{ then integrated over} \\ \lambda = \frac{\int (fy'^{2} + gy^{2})dx}{\int y^{2}dx} \\ \delta W(\xi^{*},\xi) = -\frac{1}{2}\int \xi^{*}\cdot\vec{F}(\xi)d\vec{r} \\ = -\frac{1}{2}\int \xi^{*}\cdot[\frac{1}{\mu_{0}}(\nabla \times \vec{Q}) \times \vec{B} + \frac{1}{\mu_{0}}(\nabla \times \vec{B}) \times \vec{Q} + \nabla(\gamma p \nabla \cdot \xi + \xi \cdot \nabla p)]d\vec{r} \\ K(\xi^{*},\xi) = \frac{1}{2}\int \rho |\xi|^{2}d\vec{r}$$

Any allowable function  $\xi$  for which  $\omega^2$  becomes an extremum is an eigenfunction of the ideal MHD normal mode equations with eigenvalue  $\omega^2$ .

#### Variational Principle

 $-\omega^2 \rho \xi = \vec{F}(\xi)$  normal-mode formulation

 $\omega^{2} = \frac{\delta W(\xi^{*},\xi)}{K(\xi^{*},\xi)} \quad \text{dot product with } \xi^{*} \text{ then integrated over the plasma volume}$ 

$$\lambda = \frac{\int (fy'^2 + gy^2) dx}{\int y^2 dx}$$

$$-\omega^2 K + \delta W = 0$$

Kinetic energy

Conservation of energy

- Change in potential energy associated with the perturbation

- Equal to the work done against the force  $\mathbf{F}(\xi)$ 
  - in displacing the plasma by an amount  $\xi$ .



• Energy Principle

$$\omega^2 = \frac{\partial W}{K} \ge 0 \quad \text{stable}$$
$$\delta W \ge 0 \quad \text{stable}$$

$$\begin{split} \delta W &= \delta W_F + \delta W_S + \delta W_V \\ \delta W_F &= \frac{1}{2} \int_P d\vec{r} \left[ \frac{\left| \vec{Q} \right|^2}{\mu_0} - \xi_{\perp}^* \cdot (\vec{J} \times \vec{Q}) + \gamma p \left| \nabla \cdot \xi \right|^2 + (\xi_{\perp} \cdot \nabla p) \nabla \cdot \xi_{\perp}^* \right] \\ \delta W_S &= \frac{1}{2} \int_S d\vec{S} \left| \vec{n} \cdot \xi_{\perp} \right|^2 \vec{n} \cdot \left[ \left[ \nabla \left( p + B^2 / 2\mu_0 \right) \right] \right] \\ \delta W_V &= \frac{1}{2} \int_V d\vec{r} \frac{\left| \hat{B}_1 \right|^2}{\mu_0} \end{split}$$

Boundary conditions on trial functions

$$\vec{n}\cdot\hat{B}_1\Big|_{r_w}=0 \qquad \vec{n}\cdot\hat{B}_1\Big|_{r_p}=\hat{B}_1\cdot\nabla(\vec{n}\cdot\xi_{\perp})-(\vec{n}\cdot\xi_{\perp})[\vec{n}\cdot(\vec{n}\cdot\nabla)\hat{B}_1]\Big|_{r_p}$$





#### Ideal MHD Instabilities in a Tokamak

- 1. Internal localised interchange instabilities: Mercier criterion
- 2. Low-*n* internal modes: Sawtooth
- 3. m = 1 external kink modes: Kruskal-Shafranov limit
- 4. Ballooning modes
- 5. External ballooning-kink modes
- 6. Resistive wall modes
- 7. n = 0 axisymmetric modes

- Internal localised interchange instabilities: Mercier criterion
- $\frac{d}{dx}\left(x^{2}\frac{d\xi}{dx}\right)+D_{s}\xi=0$ Straight tokamak: Euler-Lagrange equation  $\xi = x^{p}$   $p(p+1)+D_{s} = 0$   $p_{1,2} = -\frac{1}{2}\pm\frac{1}{2}(1-4D_{s})^{1/2}$ Straight tokamak: Euler-Lagrange equation  $\left(\frac{rq'}{q}\right)^{2}+\frac{8\mu_{0}rp'}{B_{\phi}^{2}}>0$ Suydam's criterion  $p_{1,2} = -\frac{1}{2}\pm\frac{1}{2}(1-4D_{s})^{1/2}$

For a circular cross section, large aspect ratio with  $eta_{
ho} \sim 1$ 

 $\left(\frac{rq'}{q}\right)^2 + 4r\beta'(1-q^2) > 0$  Mercier criterion

For a non-circular cross section

$$1 < q_0^2 \left\{ 1 - \frac{4}{1 + 3\kappa^2} \left[ \frac{3}{4} \frac{\kappa^2 - 1}{\kappa^2 + 1} \left( \kappa^2 - \frac{2\delta}{\varepsilon} \right) + \frac{(\kappa - 1)^2 \beta_{p0}}{\kappa(\kappa + 1)} \right] \right\}$$





#### • Low-n internal modes: Sawtooth



- 1. T(0) and j(0) rise
- 2. q(0) falls below 1
  - $\rightarrow$  kink instability grows
- Fast reconnection event:
   *T*, *n* flattened inside *q* = 1 surface
   *q*(0) rises slightly above 1
   kink stable





- m = 1 external kink mode: Kruskal-Shafranov limit
- In the limit where the conducting wall moves to infinity

$$\frac{\delta W_2}{W_0} = \xi_0^2 \left( n - \frac{1}{q_a} \right) \left[ \left( n - \frac{1}{q_a} \right) + \left( n + \frac{1}{q_a} \right) \right] = 2\xi_0^2 \left[ n \left( n - \frac{1}{q_a} \right) \right]$$

Kruskal-Shafranov criterion:

 $q_a > 1$  stability condition for the m = 1 external kink mode for the worst case, n = 1

Imposing an important constraint on tokamak operation: toroidal current upper limit ( $I < I_{KS}$ )

$$I_{KS} \equiv 2\pi a^2 B_0 / \mu_0 R_0 = 5a^2 B_0 / R_0 [MA] \quad \text{add}$$

$$q_{a} = \frac{aB_{0}}{\mu_{0}R_{0}I_{KS} / 2\pi a} = 1$$



100'

Ballooning modes



$$\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \left[ (1 + \Lambda^2) \frac{\partial X}{\partial \theta} \right] + \alpha (\Lambda \sin \theta + \cos \theta) X = 0$$

 $\Lambda(\theta) = s(\theta - \theta_0) - \alpha(\sin\theta - \sin\theta_0)$ 

desired form of the ballooning mode equation for the model equilibrium (s, a)

$$s = \frac{rq}{q} \text{ average shear}$$
  
$$\alpha = -\frac{2\mu_0 r^2 p'}{R_0 B_{\theta}^2} = -\frac{r^2 B_0^2}{R_0^2 B_{\theta}^2} \cdot R_0 \cdot \frac{p'}{B_0^2 / 2\mu_0} = -q^2 R_0 \beta'$$

measure of the pressure gradient 45

Ballooning modes

#### Numerical Solution





• External ballooning-kink modes

Sharp Boundary Model: surface current model

- For low  $\beta$ , the ballooning contribution negligible

• Numerical Results: The Sykes Limit, the Troyon Limit

Once an equilibrium is established, the following stability tests are made.

- (1) Mercier stability
- (2) High-*n* ballooning modes
- (3) Low-*n* internal modes
- (4) External ballooning-kink modes
- Helpful in the design of new experiments and in the interpretation and analysis of existing experimental data
- Playing a role in the determination of optimised configurations
- Quantitative predictions for the maximum  $\beta_t$  or  $I_0$  and that can be stably maintained in MHD equilibrium

$$\beta_t = 0.028 \left( \frac{I_0}{aB_0} \right)$$
$$\beta_t = 0.14 \left( \frac{\varepsilon \kappa}{q_*} \right)$$

Troyon limit



20.0

10.0

- Saddle coils for direct stabilisation
- Different feedback schemes exist
- First results look promising
- New experiments with in-vessel coils under way on DIII-D





#### Summary

- Definition of Ideal MHD
- Equilibrium
- Stability

### References

- http://www.dreamstime.com/stock-images-blue-3d-plasma-fluidimage698604

- http://www.runme.org/project/+plasmapong/

- http://www.what-is-this.com/blogs/archives/Science-blog/507424311-Dec-16-2008.html

- http://www.lhc-closer.es/pages/phy\_1.html
- http://www.phy.cuhk.edu.hk/contextual/heat/tep/trans01\_e.html
- http://twistedphysics.typepad.com/cocktail\_party\_physics/biophysics/
   http://www.antonine-

education.co.uk/Physics\_GCSE/Unit\_1/Topic\_1/topic\_1\_how\_is\_heat\_tran sferred.htm

- http://kayronjm.blogspot.com/2008/10/trouble-with-hydrostaticequilibrium.html